

APNIC EC Meeting Minutes

Wednesday 19 October 2005

Meeting Start: 11:15 am (UTC+10)

Minutes

Present:

Akinori Maemura (Chair)
Che-Hoo Cheng
Billy Cheon
Qian Hualin
Vinh Ngo
Kuo-Wei Wu
Ma Yan

Paul Wilson
Irene Chan
Connie Chan
Geoff Huston
Anne Lord
Gerard Ross (minutes)

Agenda:

1. Agenda bashing
2. Minutes from last meeting (6 September 2005)
3. Financial report for September 2005
4. RIR region change
5. ICANN/NRO status
6. WSIS update
7. AOB

1. Agenda bashing

The following topics are also to be discussed:

- None.

2. Minutes from last meeting (6 September 2005)

- The minutes from the meeting on 6 September 2005 were discussed and approved.
- **Action ec-05-021:** EC to prepare a statement to other RIR Boards regarding contributions to NRO coordination efforts. **Open - Updated:** EC Chair to raise this again on the RIR Boards list.
- **Action ec-05-022:** Secretariat to publish minutes from 6 September 2005.

3. Financial report for September 2005

- This report also includes summaries of the last two quarters.
- It was noted that there appeared to be a discrepancy in the reporting of investment values. There was an explanation of the way the investments were valued and reported and which amounts were included. It was suggested that a summary of the reporting method should be circulated by email.

- There was a discussion of the distribution of travel expenses across the three quarters to date. It was noted that the September report does not include all of the expenses incurred from the Hanoi meeting.
- It was noted that the travel expenses for the year are nine percent above budget, which may have been influenced by increases in fuel prices flowing through to airfares. It was also noted that the travel expenses vary from quarter to quarter depending on the meetings that must be attended. There was a suggestion of providing a more detailed breakdown of travel expenses. However, it was noted that travel expenses are within the normal bounds of budget variation.
- It was noted that root server equipment purchases and other internal equipment purchases shown in this report have contributed to relatively high capital expenditures.
- The EC approved this report.
- **Action ec-05-023:** Secretariat to circulate an explanation of the quarterly reporting of investment values.

4. RIR region change

- It was noted that there has been a request from a party in Guam to transfer Guam from the APNIC region to the ARIN region. This request was originally made to ICANN, which referred it to APNIC. This is the first request of this nature (apart from the establishment of LACNIC and AfriNIC).
- It is not known whether this request represents the wishes of the government of Guam or any significant part of the ISP community in Guam.
- Historically, the regions have always been considered to be defined geographically rather than geopolitically.
- The ICANN definition of the regions does not correspond with the RIR regions.
- It was noted that Guam and American Samoa are formally territories of the United States.
- Concerns were expressed about the implications of APNIC looking at political considerations rather than geographical ones.
- This issue is due to be discussed at NRO EC level in the near future.
- It was suggested that adopting a geopolitical definition of the region may dilute the role of the RIR as an industry representative. However, there may need to be consideration of the view of industry groups in our region.
- It was noted that the RIR system is heavily based on geography. If geographical considerations are relaxed, it may have implications for the number of RIRs and the way they operate.
- It was noted that this is more than just a bilateral discussion between APNIC and ARIN.

5. ICANN/NRO status

- The NRO incorporation documents are now complete. It is intended that they be signed at the ARIN meeting in LA, depending on the requirements of Uruguayan law.
- There is still an outstanding issue about the composition of the NRO Control Board. It has been suggested that members of the Control Board should be drawn from the RIR Boards.
- Service and funding contracts between ICANN and NRO are still under legal review. The RIRs have decided not to make any further payments to ICANN until the contracts are finalised and signed. This decision may be reviewed in the future.
- There is a meeting planned for the ICANN meeting in Vancouver, relating to some IANA issues.
- ICANN has unilaterally decided to appoint an IANA account manager.

- ICANN does not seem clear about the role of the ASO AC as it relates to the NRO or the RIRs. It has been stressed to ICANN that the ASO has a narrow mandate which relates to address policy only and that it is the NRO that should be consulted on issues such as the ICANN strategic plan.
- It was suggested that having the NRO Control Board composed of people other than the RIR CEOs would improve the perception of the NRO.
- It was suggested that if there are concerns about control and hierarchy, then perhaps the RIR Board Chairs are not the best choice for the Control Board.
- The RIRs will each choose their own method for appointing their respective Control Board member.

6. WSIS update

- The NRO was represented for the entire two weeks of the recent WSIS PrepCom.
- There was little progress at the PrepCom until the second week, when the deadlines became pressing.

There were several proposals made late in the period, including a controversial proposal by the EU, who proposed an oversight mechanism within a UN framework, but not necessarily by the UN itself. It was noted that many people seem to have misunderstood the intention of the EU proposal.

- A proposal known as the "Western" proposal was supported by countries including Canada, Japan, Australia, Argentina and Uruguay, but this has not gathered broad support so far.
- The US has responded by repeating its non-negotiable position. It has also been reported that the US has expressed its disappointment with the EU position at a diplomatic level.
- APNIC, through the NRO, is cooperating with ISOC to staff a booth at Tunis promoting the current Internet model. However the NRO is attending WSIS as an independent body in its own right.
- The WSIS documents to date include a paragraph noting the importance of the current regional address management institutions.
- The NRO EC is planning another statement about Internet governance in the WSIS context.
- It was noted that much of the outcomes of WSIS will depend on the US position.
- There was a discussion about possible implications within the ITU-T forums if WSIS ends in deadlock.
- There was a brief discussion of EC participation in WSIS forums.

7. AOB

- None.

8. Next meeting

- TBA

Meeting closed: 12:40 pm (UTC+10)

Open action items

- **Action ec-05-021:** EC to prepare a statement to other RIR Boards regarding contributions to NRO coordination efforts. **Open - Updated:** EC Chair to raise this again on the RIR Boards list.
- **Action ec-05-022:** Secretariat to publish minutes from 6 September 2005.

- **Action ec-05-023:** Secretariat to circulate an explanation of the quarterly reporting of investment values.